7th Vaccine Acceptance Meeting

Foudation Mérieux - Annecy, France September 23, 2019

Shots Heard Round The World – TOUR 2019

Todd Wolynn MD, MMM, IBCLC



Todd Wolynn MD, IBCLC, MMM

My Vaccine Path

>25 years of Pediatric Primary Care

14 years of Clinical Vaccine Research

>10 years of QualityCare focused on Metrics& Process Improvement



Our Vaccine Saga

A 2 year ongoing crazy ride!

We never saw coming! But we never let go!







Fiercely Independent Community-connected Entrepreneurial & Innovative Communication-obsessed





3 Offices in: Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania ~20 Providers ~100 Employees <u>Measured/Tiered</u> Highest Quality Lowest Cost

Advocacy Video

https://vimeo.com/266593233



Patient Population Cared for: Urban, Suburban & Rural Patients High, Middle & Low Socio-Economic Strong Community Integration & Trust Physically & Virtually Peer-to-Peer: Resonant & ImpactIndependent: Unencumbered"Living Lab": R&D-orientedSuccessful: Execution & Delivery

	Clinical	Research	Business
Immunization	Vaccinators	14 years	Process Mastery
Communication	Communicators	2 years	Integrated
Public Health	Practitioners	2 years	Policy & Testing









Independent & Tenacious Adaptable **Connecting & Impactful**





Medicine & Business Focused Patient-Family-Community Innovative & Collaborative





Nimble yet Powerful "Living Lab" Successful



Longitudinal Relationship



Years



Multimodal





Communication

We Know Our Audience



and How to Reach Them





Social Media















Mercedes-Benz The best or nothing.





Vaccinate







#WhyIVax

https://youtu.be/Hgl9RrpiDD8

[video]

Get it

https://youtu.be/8pDXn2hkqrU

[video]

We Prevent Cancer

https://youtu.be/wPZGe1WnL5E

[video]

Wednesday, August 23rd, 2017 8:45am



"At Kids Plus, we're thrilled to provide the HPV vaccine. In this video, our providers tell you why."

Friday, September 15th, 2017 1:15pm



"Is this some kind of joke? This vaccine kills people."

Sunday, September 23rd, 2017 11:00pm



Banned: 808 attackers **Deleted**: >10,000 comments

344 DAYS LATER

Time taken until all anti-vaxx attack fraudulent reviews were removed

...all it took was:

- increasing global Measles outbreaks
- public shaming via popular national traditional media outlets

Anti-Vaccine Harassment, Bullying and Threats



Reputation Smear and Harm



Required Resources for Repair







Being victimized was terrible

We weren't going to be the last victim

Better resources were necessary – now!

Let them know 'they picked on the wrong group'

So we launched a 4-pronged counter-response

Advocacy Goals 2018-19

 Peer-Reviewed Research w the University of Pittsburgh, School of Public Health
Shots Heard Round the World a rapid-response social media cavalry
Social Media Toolkit prepare, defend and clean-up after an attack
Social Media Platform Awareness/Responsibility Strategies and responses for untrue (medical) news



Vaccine 37 (2019) 2216-2223



It's not all about autism: The emerging landscape of anti-vaccination sentiment on Facebook

Beth L. Hoffman^{a,b,c}, Elizabeth M. Felter^c, Kar-Hai Chu^{a,b,f}, Ariel Shensa^{a,b}, Chad Hermann^d, Todd Wolynn^d, Daria Williams^b, Brian A. Primack^{a,b,e,f,*}

^a Division of General Internal Medicine, Department of Medicine, University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine, 1218 Scaife Hall, 35505 Terrace Street, Pittsburgh, PA 15261,

Difficult of General International International Control of Medicine, 230 McKee Place, Suite 600, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, United States ¹Center for Research on Media, Technology, and Health, University of Pittsburgh, School of Public Health, University of Pittsburgh, 130 De Soto Street, Pittsburgh, PA 15261, United States ⁶State Public Reduktions, 4070 Beechwood Blod, Pittsburgh, PA 15271, United States

¹Division of Adolescent Medicine, Department of Pediatrics, University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine, 1218 Scalifs Hall, 35505 Terrace Street, Pittsburgh, PA 15261, United States

ABSTRACT ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 20 December 2018

Received in revised form 5 March 2019 Accepted 6 March 2019 Available online 21 March 2019 Keywords Facebook Social media Anti-vaccination Health communication

Primary Care

In-the-trenches

Academic rigor

Dissect Attack

Reveal insights

Move Forward

Background: Due in part to declining vaccination rates, in 2018 over 20 states reported at least one case of measles and over 40,000 cases were confirmed in Europe. Anti-vaccine posts on social media may be facilitating anti-vaccination behaviour. This study aimed to systematically characterize (1) individuals known to publicly post anti-vaccination content on Facebook, (2) the information they convey, and (3) the spread of this content. Methods: Our data set consisted of 197 individuals who posted anti-vaccination comments in response to a message promoting vaccination. We systematically analysed publicly-available content using quantita-

tive coding, descriptive analysis, social network analysis, and an in-depth qualitative assessment. The final codebook consisted of 26 codes; Cohen's κ ranged 0.71–1.0 after double-coding.

Results: The majority (98%) of individuals identified as female. Among 136 individuals who divulged their location, 36 states and 8 other countries were represented. In a 2-mode network of individuals and topics, modularity analysis revealed 4 distinct sub-groups labelled as "trust," "alternatives," "safety," and "con-spiracy." For example, a comment representative of "conspiracy" is that poliovirus does not exist and that pesticides caused clinical symptoms of polio. An example from the "alternatives" sub-group is that eating yogurt cures human papillomavirus. Deeper qualitative analysis of all 197 individuals' profiles found that these individuals also tended to post material against other health-related practices such as water fluoridation and circumcision.

Conclusions: Social media outlets may facilitate anti-vaccination connections and organization by facilitating the diffusion of centuries old arguments and techniques. Arguments against vaccination are diverse but remain consistent within sub-groups of individuals. It would be valuable for health professionals to leverage social networks to deliver more effective, targeted messages to different constituencies.

© 2019 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Check fo

Abbreviations: AIDS, Acquired immunodeficiency syndrome: CDC, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention: DAV. distinctly anti-vaccination: DDT. Dichlorodiphenyltrichloroethane; FDA, Food and Drug Administration; GMO, Genetically modified organism; HPV, human papillomavirus; MMR, measles, mumps, rubella; NASA, National Aeronautics and Space Administration; VAERS,

Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting System; WHO, World Health Organization. * Corresponding author at: Center for Research on Media, Technology, and Health, University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine, 230 McKee Place, Suite 600, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, United States,

Fritsburgi, FA 15215, omreu sates. E-mail addresses: bih72@pitt.edu (B.L. Hoffman), emfelter@pitt.edu (E.M. Felter), chu&@pitt.edu (K.-H. Chu), ariel.shensa@pitt.edu (A. Shensa), chad@kidspluspgh. com (C. Hermann), todd@kidspluspgh.com (T. Wolynn), dcw36@pitt.edu (D. Williams), bprimack@pitt.edu (B.A. Primack),

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2019.03.003 0264-410X/© 2019 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Vaccines are often hailed as one of the greatest public health achievements of modern medicine, and high levels of vaccination have substantially curbed the rate of vaccine-preventable diseases and early deaths [1,2]. Community protection refers to the concept that if a sufficiently high number of individuals in the population are vaccinated, even those who cannot be vaccinated due to age or existing medical conditions will be protected [3]. However, in the United States (U.S.) only 70% of children 19-35 months receive all recommended immunizations, and over the past decade there

Vaccine

published: March 2019





Advocacy Goals 2018-19

Peer-Reviewed Research w the University of Pittsburgh, School of Public Health





Join@ShotsHeard.com



Alert@ShotsHeard.com









the World Closed group About		Closed
Discussion	and the second sec	ciosea
Chats		
Announcements		Group
Members		Group
Events		
Photos		
Group Insights	Joined 👻 🗸 Notifications 🏕 Share 🛛 … More	
Moderate Group		
	🖋 Write Post 🛛 📧 Add Photo/Video 🖉 Live Video 🖉 More	INVITE MEMBERS Embed Invite
Search this group Q		+ Enter name or email address
Shortcuts	write something	MEMBERS
Kids Plus Pediatrics Sheldrake Point Wine	👩 Photo/Video 🛛 🙀 Watch Party 🖉 Tag Friends \cdots	You have 11 new members Write Post
MHSWWE	44 people and 3 Pages want to join this group ×	welcome them.
Shots Heard Round the		DESCRIPTION Edi
Taylor Aliderdice Cro 1	Announcements	Powered by Science. Protecting Public Health
👗 Refutations to co 20+	Chad Hermann	Shots Heard Round See More
Allderdice Dragon Run	W Admin - April 9	GROUP TYPE
	Just a reminder that we only admit people to this group after they've been vetted. So if you'd like to invite friends and colleagues to join us	General
	here and we hope you do please invite them first to join the Shots	LOCATION
	Heard digital cavairy by sending an email to join@shotsheard.com.	
	The way	V Plug Location



@ShotsHeard

Shots Heard Round the World

Launched on Sept. 18th, 2019

Advocacy Goals 2018-19

 Peer-Reviewed Research w the University of Pittsburgh, School of Public Health
Shots Heard Round the World a rapid-response social media cavalry



Giving Vaccine Advocates everywhere needed resources & strategies



k İ d S 📑

Social Media Strategy Guide & Anti-Vaccine Combat Toolkit

How to Prepare For, Defend Against, and Clean Up After an Anti-Vaxx Attack

Release on: September 23rd 2019



Strategy Guide & Toolkit

80+ Pages from In-the-Trenches **Experience & Expertise** Comprehensive, Real-Time, Battle-Tested Links, Lessons, Insights, Resources **Empower Providers/Practices to Post Prepare Providers/Practices for Attacks** Step-by-Step Instructions to Defend/Clean-Up Facebook, Yelp, Google Strategies Undo Damage & Mange Online Reputation Access to a National Social Media Support Network A Living Document



k i d s 🗄

Table of Contents

CONTENTS

Call For Reinforcements

Monitor Yelp & Immediately Report Attacks

	INTRODUCTION The Wild, Wild West	4	CLEAN UP Mop Up	48
	CASE STUDY Six Days in September Timeline of the Attack The First Shot The First Six Days	5	First Principles Leftover Facebook Clean Up Report Fraudulent Yelp Reviews Flag & Report Fraudulent Google Reviews Reporting Fraudulent Facebook Reviews	
	The Cavalry Arrives The Source of the Attack A Profile of the Attackers		CONCLUSION The War Rages On	66
	The Tactics They Use The Lessons We Learned		APPENDIX A Step-By-Step Outline to Prepare	67
	PREPARE Stand Up	17	APPENDIX B Step-By-Step Outline to Defend	68
First Principles In the Office Facebook Yelp Google Ready the Reinf	First Principles In the Office Facebook		APPENDIX C Step-By-Step Outline to Clean Up APPENDIX D Using the Facebook Pages Manager App	69 70
	Yelp Google Ready the Reinforcements		APPENDIX E The "No-Fly" Pre-Ban List	72
	DEFEND Saddle Up	30		
	First Principles Wait For It Do Not Engage Disable Facebook Reviews & Recommendations Ban Facebook Attackers Batch-Ban Multiple Attackers Through Comment Moderation Disable Visitor Posts Watch Notifications			

Advocacy Goals 2018-19

Peer-Reviewed Research w the University of Pittsburgh, School of Public Health Shots Heard Round the World a rapid-response social media cavalry 📥 Social Media Toolkit prepare, defend and clean-up after an attack



Presented: on Anti-Vaccine Disinformation Campaigns and Improving Vaccine Communication





Los Angeles Times

Anti-vaccine activists have doctors 'terrorized into silence' with online harassment

Why anti-vaxxer mobs go after provaccine doctors online — and what to do about it

Mashable voto eventement + cuture + mor + scence + social acco + sice + wore +

By SOUMYA KARLAMANGLA MAR 18, 2019 | 5:00 AM



Dr. Todd Wolynn, left, and Chad Hermann, the communications director for Wolynn's pediatrics practice in Pittsburgh, have been speaking at conferences trying to encourage doctors to fight back on the subject of immunizations. (Jeff Swensen / For The Times)

Health » Anti-vaxiers and Facebook: The four subgroups that fuel online attacks

Decoding anti-vax content on Facebook

e

The study was inspired by Kids Plus Pediatrics, an independent pediatric care Pittsburgh, which posted a video on Facebook in August 2017 about how it off papillomavirus vaccine. About a month after the video was posted, anti-vaccin appeared in response to the video.

The comments were so inflammatory that, in the new study, researchers decid closer look and analyze the accounts behind the comments. Che Washington post

Anti-vaxxers trolled a doctor's office. Here's what scientists learned from the attack.



A Pittsburgh pediatric practice posted this promotional video-on social media in August 2017 about importance of getting HPV vaccine. (The Washington Post)

By Lena H. Sun



in the summer of 2017, Kids Plus Pediatrics of Pittsburgh posted a video on its ents to vaccinate their children against human papillomavirus, or <u>HPV</u>, which can . Three weeks later, communications director Chad Hermann noticed "something.

e claim that "the vaccine kills." Within minutes, more anti-vaccine comments came someone inside a closed Facebook group started sending private messages with i see them coordinating the attacks," Hermann recalled.

cover that a woman in Australia was particularly active, directing people to give the 1 on various social media platforms. "She would say, 'Let's move on to Yelp reviews,' 149, 'Let's go after the Facebook reviews,' " Hermann recalled.

M e d i

a

Advocacy Goals 2018-19

 Peer-Reviewed Research w the University of Pittsburgh, School of Public Health
Shots Heard Round the World a rapid-response social media cavalry
Social Media Toolkit prepare, defend and clean-up after an attack
Social Media Platform Awareness/Responsibility Strategies and responses for untrue (medical) news



Two-parts 'Monty Python' Two-parts 'Trevor Noah' & Two-parts Humor/Billion "It's so Diluted... ... its Homeopathic Humor!"

It's as if Marvel Studios, Federico Fellini and U2 got together to create a Vaccine Rock Opera!



Sponsored by **Doctors** without Nonsense "They really did pick on the wrong group!" Just when you thought it was safe to go back onto Twitter"

Forces Upon Vaccine Hesitancy



When they are <u>not</u> face-to-face with a trusted health professional

Random State




Shame Social Media Platforms







Social Media Platforms

Algorithm Changes with CDC/WHO prompts are nice but - they're fixing a problem they created

Pseudoscience & Conspiracies no longer preferentially served - but are still just a click away

Anti-Vax Social Media threats, attacks & harm persist - but should be blocked, lessened and promptly resolved

More Must Be Done to Address these Attacks!

The Power of the HCP Recommendation

Many HCP's inject personal Communication deficiencies into their vaccination recommendations which unnecessarily weakens their effort

As a result, the potential power and impact of HCP vaccination recommendation is squandered





Face-to-Face Vaccine Communication

The AIMS method for talking about protection

Announce Inquire Mirror Secure







Angus Thomson

Adjunct Assistant Professor, Emory University Head, Vaccine Confidence & Coverage Global Public Affairs, Sanofi Pasteur



John Parrish-Sprowl

Director, Global Health Communication Center (GHCC) Indiana University School of Liberal Arts

Every Child · Every Age · Everywhere

Face-to-Face Vaccine Communication

Vaccine communication is often ineffective and can sometimes backfire

What HCP's Think



What Patients and Families Want and Don't Want



Photos like this

made hesitant parents aware of the dangers of measles, but decreased the intention to vaccinate and increased misconceptions about the MMR vaccine^{1,2}



Facts on flu vaccines

decreased the belief that flu vaccines cause flu, but also decreased the intention to vaccinate

Communication is often ineffective and can sometimes backfire

Face-to-Face Vaccine Communication

AIMS

Announce Inquire Mirror Secure **Objective** To increase the effectiveness of conversation between HCP's and Patients on healthy preventative behaviors such as vaccinations



Greater your confidence in talking about preventative behaviors More people adopting preventative behaviors









Communicate Powerfully

Listen, Understand Fight Fear with Trust Face-to-Face **and** Virtually Use Narrative and Storytelling Utilize Research and Best-Practices Advocate, Innovate, Collaborate, and Care

Vaccinate Successfully



Dr. Todd Wolynn @DrToddWo

As a pediatrician I'm thrilled to work with kids to protect/improve their health.

As a new Doc ~25yrs ago, I was prepared and focused to combat viruses, bacteria and malignancies.

Little did I know the biggest threats would come from insurances, politics and pseudoscience.

7:50 AM - 4 Jan 2019



Thank You

Dr. Todd Wolynn



Kids Plus Pediatrics

@DrToddWo



@KidsPlusPgh